Beckwith, William

From: Beckwith, William

Sent: Tuesday, July 30, 2013 2:20 PM

To: Reese, Carl D (DEC)

Cc: Tabor, Brock N (DEC); Chung, Angela

Subject: RE:

Carl – My apology for not responding to your emails and voice mail on this subject. I really can not engage in thinking about the substance of the questions at this time. Generally, however, EPA will consider additional technical analysis, whether it comes directly for ADEC or someone DEC has secured; but I do not think the "third party" should be viewed as having a mediator role (thinking back to your last email when you introduced the idea noting that "DEC and EPA disagree on some conclusions...").

- Bill

From: Reese, Carl D (DEC) [mailto:carl.reese@alaska.gov]

Sent: Monday, July 29, 2013 5:28 PM

To: Beckwith, William **Cc:** Tabor, Brock N (DEC)

Subject:

Bill, This email is a followup to one I sent last week. Brock and I discussed the idea of a third party review of the WER data for Chuit with Dr Ruth Sofield this afternoon. One idea we discussed was the idea that EPA should have the opportunity to comment on the questions addressed in review *apriori*. At a minimum it would be useful to have feedback from you on whether the EPA thinks there is value in an independent party reviewing this data.

I don't anticipate evaluating these questions would take more than 30 minutes of your time at most.

This is a draft of our questions so far.

Questions To Address In Review.

I. Background

1. Is TetraTech's analysis comparing the water chemistry of the three creeks under consideration sufficient to suggest the site water used for the WER tests can apply to all three creeks?

II. Testing

- 2. Should chronic synergistic effects and criteria be derived using acute mixed metals tests? If so, how?
- 3. Is it possible to rely on the results of mixed metals testing when aluminum is one of the metals being considered?
- 4. Are the results from the individual WER tests adequate for setting new SSC when multiple metals are being proposed given the data from all of the testing that has been conducted?

Feel free to contact Brock or me about this. Cheers Carl